

Example of a Helpful Review of an Accepted Paper

NON-EMPIRICAL STUDY

MERGA RESEARCH PAPERS: REVIEWER REPORT FORM

I have reviewed the paper:

Title: Reflections on reflective primary mathematics teaching practices

Code: RP42

As a research paper for presentation at MERGA 26 and publication in the conference proceedings, I recommend that the paper be (delete two):

ACCEPTED

Please supply below reasons for the acceptance or rejection of the paper commenting on each of the categories specified below, as appropriate. You may refer to more issues than suggested by the categories if you wish.

Statement of problem/issue and discussion of its significance:

The focus of this paper, reflective primary mathematics teaching practices, is an important topic to review. The authors develop a constructive case for the need to question whether the positive rhetoric associated with this issue is evident through the research literature in this field.

Literature review and theoretical framework:

The theoretical literature and the research literature presented were extensive and thoroughly synthesised.

Methodology and data analysis (when applicable):

Not applicable

Discussion:

Based on the synthesis of the literature the authors argue strongly that the theoretical foundations for advocating reflective practices appear sound. They provide extensive evidence to support their contentions that research in the field has been inappropriately theorised. They claim that findings associated with studies investigating mathematics teaching as it takes place in primary classrooms do not conclusively support the outcomes predicted by theory.

Conclusions and implications:

The authors draw several apt and forthright conclusions regarding the two dimensions of the literature they examined. The implications for future research directions were clearly articulated. There was no discussion of implications for teacher education and the teaching profession. Perhaps the authors would like to elaborate further on the implications for these stakeholders in their oral presentations.

General comments including reasons for the recommendation:

The paper was clearly written. The content and the arguments present stimulate thinking on the issue reflective practice, a phenomenon that is assumed to have beneficial outcomes for teachers and students alike and is taken for granted in contemporary educational settings.

Minor revision: Notes for editorial team

Please note here any minor revisions that can be completed by the editorial team (e.g., typographical errors, grammatical points, ways in which the paper does not conform to the MERGA layout and presentation guidelines for publication of MERGA papers)

Missen (2001) is cited in the text but is not found in the reference list.

Typo in first sentence of last page (their)

apostrophes have been misused (e.g. p.7: students'; p.9 it's)

Would you like copies of the comments of the other reviewer/s of this paper to be e-mailed to you?

YES