

Example of a Helpful Review of an Accepted Paper

EMPIRICAL STUDY

MERGA RESEARCH PAPERS: REVIEWER REPORT FORM

I have reviewed the paper:

Title: Learning Fractional Concepts Using the Number Line

Code: ...RP44....

As a research paper for presentation at MERGA 26 and publication in the conference proceedings, I recommend that the paper be (delete two):

ACCEPTED

Please supply below reasons for the acceptance or rejection of the paper commenting on each of the categories specified below, as appropriate. You may refer to more issues than suggested by the categories if you wish.

Statement of problem/issue and discussion of its significance:

The context for the investigation, the research issues and their relevance to the field are clearly articulated.

Literature review and theoretical framework:

This is a small-scale study that builds on prior work by ---- and ---- on the learning of rational number concepts. The theoretical framework is clearly laid out and provides justification for the choice of research questions and the research methods to explore them. The literature consulted is appropriate but could have been more extensive. However, the gaps in current knowledge were highlighted well.

Methodology and data analysis (when applicable):

The study is primarily descriptive, with ongoing analysis of the data. The descriptions of students' work, together with the verbal data, are well selected to support the points made by the author, although I would have preferred to see other evidence provided in addition to that here.

Discussion:

The authors make a clear connection between their analysis of student learning and the theoretical framework used. The results are clearly presented and the discussion of them is well substantiated by the data.

Conclusions and implications:

The conclusions drawn by the authors are insightful and suitably tentative. The implications for classroom teachers are consistent with the findings presented. I agree that there is a need to replicate this study in other contexts. Have the authors thought about the implications for teacher educators?

General comments including reasons for the recommendation:

For the most part, the report is well written and easy to follow. Table 1, however, appears to be missing some data (see column 2). The paper is interesting, contains original data, and adds to our understanding of how students learn rational numbers. The authors are encouraged to see the recent article by ----- in ----- which would provide an interesting comparison to the work in this paper. In the presentation, a corrected version of Table 1 should be used.

Minor revision: Notes for editorial team

Please note here any minor revisions that can be completed by the editorial team (e.g., typographical errors, grammatical points, ways in which the paper does not conform to the MERGA layout and presentation guidelines for publication of MERGA papers)

p.2 para 2: "there" should be "their"

level 2 headings should not be in italics

Would you like copies of the comments of the other reviewer/s of this paper to be e-mailed to you?

NO